Meaning Representation in Natural Language Tasks

Gabriel Stanovsky

My Research

Develop text-processing models which exhibit facets of **human intelligence** with benefits for **users in real-life applications**

Grand Challenges in Natural Language Processing (NLP)



Machine translation

"the *universal translator*, invented in 2151, is used for *deciphering unknown languages*"



Information retrieval

"What's the second largest star in this galaxy?"



Automated assistants

"I got one of those *terrible headaches* from *lack* of sleep. Can you give me something for *it*?"

Grand Challenges in Natural Language Processing (NLP)

Machine translation

"the *universal translator*, invented in 2151, is used for *deciphering unknown languages*"

NLP models need to capture the **meaning behind our words** and interact accordingly galaxy?"



Automated assistance

"I got one of those *terrible headaches* from *lack* of sleep. Can you give me something for *it*?"

• The **information** conveyed in a natural language utterance

- The **information** conveyed in a natural language utterance
- Abstracts over myriad of possible surface forms

- The **information** conveyed in a natural language utterance
- Abstracts over myriad of possible surface forms



- The **information** conveyed in a natural language utterance
- Abstracts over myriad of possible surface forms

Cows mainly eat grass, and can enjoy up to 75 pounds of it a day



- The **information** conveyed in a natural language utterance
- Abstracts over myriad of possible surface forms

Cows mainly eat grass, and can enjoy up to 75 pounds of it a day



Grass is the major ingredient in bovine nutrition, reaching a maximum of 75 pounds consumed daily

Outline: Research Questions

Do NLP models capture meaning?

ACL 2019 **Set Nominated for Best Paper** MRQA 2019 **Best Paper award** EMNLP 2018

Models miss crucial meaning aspects

Gender bias in machine translation

How can we build parsers for meaning?

EMNLP 2016a, EMNLP 2016b, ACL 2016a, ACL 2016b, ACL 2017, NAACL 2018, EMNLP2018a, EMNLP2018b, CoNLL 2019 Honorable mention



Data collection

QA is an intuitive annotation format

Model design

Robust performance across domains

Can we integrate meaning into NLP?

ACL 2015, EACL 2017, SemEval 2017, NAACL 2017, SemEval 2019



Real-world application

Adverse drug reactions on social media

Outline: Research Questions

Do NLP models capture meaning?

ACL 2019 **Nominated for Best Paper** MRQA 2019 **Best Paper award** EMNLP 2018

Q,

Models miss crucial meaning aspects

Gender bias in machine translation

How can we build parsers for meaning? EMNLP 2016a, EMNLP 2016b, ACL 2016a, ACL 2016b, ACL 2017, NAACL 2018, EMNLP2018a, EMNLP2018b,

CoNLL 2019 Honorable mention

Can we integrate meaning into NLP? ACL 2015, EACL 2017, SemEval 2017, NAACL 2017, SemEval 2019

Background: How should we represent text?



Background: How should we represent text?

Explicitly! We should define a formal representation of meaning



- Many formalisms developed in linguistic literature
 - Dictating how *meaning* should be represented



[1] Banarescu et al, 2013 [2] Oepen et al., 2014 [3] Abend and Rappoport, 2017

- Many formalisms developed in linguistic literature
 - Dictating how *meaning* should be represented











- (A) $(\forall x \text{ fsa}(x)) \Rightarrow (\exists y \text{ pda}(y) \land \text{ equivalent}(x, y))$
- (B) ~ $\forall y (\exists x fsa(x) \Rightarrow pda(y) \land equivalent(x, y))$
- (C) $\forall x \exists y (fsa(x) \land pda(y) \land equivalent(x, y))$
- (D) $\forall x \exists y (fsa(y) \land pda(x) \land equivalent(x, y))$

[1] Banarescu et al, 2013 [2] Oepen et al., 2014 [3] Abend and Rappoport, 2017

Explicit Representations - Propositions

- Statements with one *predicate* (event) and arbitrary number of *arguments*
 - $\circ \quad Bob \ called \ Mary \ \rightarrow \ called: (Bob, Mary)$
 - Bob gave a note to Mary → gave:(Bob, a note, Mary)
- Minimal units of information
- Form the backbone of explicit meaning representations



• Pros

- Interpretable models
- Independent progress on meaning representation





• Pros

- Interpretable models
- Independent progress on meaning representation
- Cons
 - Requires expensive expert annotations
 - Arbitrary unclear that one representation is necessarily "correct"



Background: How should we represent text?



Implicitly! Models should *learn* a latent useful representation for an end-task

• Models find correlations between word representations and task label





[1] Peters et al, 2018 [2] Devlin et al., 2019

- Models find correlations between word representations and task label
- Useful text representations found **implicitly** during the training process
 - Monolithic models trained on 100M of parameters over 1B words





[1] Peters et al, 2018 [2] Devlin et al., 2019

- Models find correlations between word representations and task label
- Useful text representations found **implicitly** during the training process
 - Monolithic models trained on 100M of parameters over 1B words





[1] Peters et al, 2018 [2] Devlin et al., 2019

- Cons
 - Opaque models
 - No control over the patterns they find useful in the data





• Cons

- Opaque models
- No control over the patterns they find useful in the data

• Pros

- No need to commit on an explicit representation
- Impressive gains on many NLP datasets
- Revolutionized the field





Natural Language Processing in 2019

Implicit representation



Explicit representation





Natural Language Processing in 2019

Implicit representation



Explicit representation





Do implicit NLP models capture meaning?

ACL 2019 **Set Nominated for Best Paper** MRQA 2019 **Best Paper award** EMNLP 2018

Many Facets to Text Understanding



[1] Stanovsky et al, 2017 [2] Stanovsky et al., 2016 [3] Stanovsky and Hopkins, 2018

Many Facets to Text Understanding

Factuality¹ Identify *if an event happened* John forgot that he <u>locked the door</u>

Coreference resolution

Implications on *gender bias* in machine translation

Word sense disambiguation³ Distinguishing *bat* from *bat*

Detect if modifiers are required or elaborating "The boy **who stopped the flood**." "Barack Obama. **the former U.S. president.**"

ACL 2019 Nominated for Best Paper

Case study: Coreference in machine translation







The **doctor** asked the nurse to help her in the procedure.



The **doctor** asked the nurse to help her in the procedure.

- *ask for help*: (the doctor, the nurse, in the procedure)
- *is female*: (the doctor)





La doctora le pidió a la enfermera que la ayudara con el procedimiento.

- *ask for help*: (the doctor, the nurse, in the procedure)
- *is female*: (the doctor)





La doctora le pidió a la enfermera que la ayudara con el procedimiento.

- *ask for help*: (the doctor, the nurse, in the procedure)
- *is female*: (the doctor)

• Can models capture the meaning conveyed through coreference?

• Growing concern that models use bias to bypass meaning interpretation

• Growing concern that models use bias to bypass meaning interpretation

• E.g., translating all doctors as men regardless of context



• Growing concern that models use bias to bypass meaning interpretation

• E.g., translating all doctors as men regardless of context



• Will work well for most cases seen during training
Is machine translation gender biased?



Alex Shams @seyyedreza

 \sim

Turkish is a gender neutral language. There is no "he" or "she" - everything is just "o". But look what happens when Google translates to English. Thread:

Turkish - detected -	Ŷ	4)	÷	English -	Ē 🜒
o bir aşçı				she is a cook	
o bir mühendis				he is an engineer	
o bir doktor				he is a doctor	
o bir hemşire				she is a nurse	
o bir temizlikçi				he is a cleaner	
o bir polis				He-she is a police	
o bir asker				he is a soldier	
o bir öğretmen				She's a teacher	
o bir sekreter				he is a secretary	

Is machine translation gender biased?



Alex Shams @seyyedreza

 \sim

Turkish is a gender neutral language. There is no "he" or "she" - everything is just "o". But look what happens when Google translates to English. Thread:



Is machine translation gender biased?

V



Alex Shams @seyyedreza

Turkish is a gender neutral language. There is no "he" or "she" - everything is just "o". But look what happens when Google translates to English. Thread:





Evaluating Coreference Translation: Challenges

- Gender bias in machine translation was noticed anecdotally
 - **Open question**: how to *quantitatively* measure gender translation?

Evaluating Coreference Translation: Challenges

- Gender bias in machine translation was noticed anecdotally
 - **Open question**: how to *quantitatively* measure gender translation?
- Requires reference translations in various languages and models
 - To reach more general conclusions

Evaluating Coreference Translation: Challenges

- Gender bias in machine translation was noticed anecdotally
 - **Open question**: how to *quantitatively* measure gender translation?
- Requires reference translations in various languages and models
 To reach more general conclusions
- Gender can be *unspecified*
 - The **doctor** had very good news



Evaluating Coreference in Machine Translation

Challenge

How to evaluate gender translation across different models & languages?

Evaluating Coreference in Machine Translation

• Input:

- Machine translation model: M
- Target language with grammatical gender: L

Challenge

How to evaluate gender translation across different models & languages?

Evaluating Coreference in Machine Translation

• Input:

- Machine translation model: M
- Target language with grammatical gender: L
- Output:
 - Accuracy score \in [0, 100]

How well does **M** translates gender information from English to **L**?

Challenge

How to evaluate gender translation across different models & languages?

English Source Texts

• Winogender¹ & WinoBias² - bias in *coreference resolution*

The **doctor** asked the nurse to help her in the procedure.

The **doctor** asked the nurse to help him in the procedure.

[1] Rudinger et al, 2018 [2] Zhao et al., 2018

English Source Texts

• Winogender¹ & WinoBias² - bias in *coreference resolution*

The **doctor** asked the nurse to help her in the procedure.

The **doctor** asked the nurse to help him in the procedure.

- Equally split between stereotypical and non-stereotypical role assignments
 - Based on U.S. labor statistics

English Source Texts

• Winogender¹ & WinoBias² - bias in *coreference resolution*

The **doctor** asked the nurse to help her in the procedure.

The **doctor** asked the nurse to help him in the procedure.

- Equally split between stereotypical and non-stereotypical role assignments
 - Based on U.S. labor statistics
- Gender-role assignments are specified (+90% human agreement)

[1] Rudinger et al, 2018 [2] Zhao et al., 2018

1. Translate the coreference bias datasets



1. Translate the coreference bias datasets

Input: MT model + target language Output: Gender accuracy





La doctora le pidió a la enfermera que le ayudara con el procedimiento.

- 1. Translate the coreference bias datasets
- 2. Align between source and target



- 1. Translate the coreference bias datasets
- 2. Align between source and target
- 3. Identify gender in target language



- 1. Translate the coreference bias datasets
- 2. Align between source and target
- 3. Identify gender in target language





The **doctor** asked the nurse to help her in the procedure.



El **doctor** le pidió a la enfermera que le ayudara con el procedimiento.

- 1. Translate the coreference bias datasets
- 2. Align between source and target
- 3. Identify gender in target language

Input: MT model + target language Output: Gender accuracy

Quality estimated at > 90%







Google Translate





Google Translate

Results

• Translation models struggle with non-stereotypical roles









Amazon Translate

Results

• Translation models struggle with non-stereotypical roles



Do NLP models capture meaning?

ACL 2019 **Solution** Nominated for Best Paper MRQA 2019 **Solution** Best Paper award EMNLP 2018

• NLP models do not capture important facets of meaning

Do NLP models capture meaning? ACL 2019 **Nominated for Best Paper** MRQA 2019 **Best Paper award** EMNLP 2018

- NLP models do not capture important facets of meaning
- Instead, they find spurious patterns in the data
 - Leading to the biased performance we've seen
 - **Biased performance in question answering, inference**, and more

Do NLP models capture meaning? ACL 2019 **Nominated for Best Paper** MRQA 2019 **Best Paper award** EMNLP 2018

- NLP models do not capture important facets of meaning
- Instead, they find spurious patterns in the data
 - Leading to the biased performance we've seen
 - Biased performance in question answering, inference, and more



Open Questions

• Do models fail at capturing meaning because of *architecture* or *data*?



Open Questions

- Do models fail at capturing meaning because of *architecture* or *data*?
- Is there a dataset that could *force* models to learn meaningful patterns?
 E.g., equally distributed between genders



Open Questions

- Do models fail at capturing meaning because of *architecture* or *data*?
- Is there a dataset that could *force* models to learn meaningful patterns?
 E.g., equally distributed between genders
- Current data augmentation efforts find **models are stubbornly biased**^[1,2,3]



[1] Wang et al., 2019 [2] Gonen & Goldberg, 2019 [3] Elazar & Goldberg, 2018

Meaning Representation in Neural Networks



Best of both worlds: models over meaningful *explicit* representations leveraging strong *implicit* architectures

Research Questions

Weaknesses in state of the art ACL 2019 Nominated for Best Paper MRQA 2019 Best Paper award EMNLP 2018

How can we build parsers for meaning?

EMNLP 2016a, EMNLP 2016b, ACL 2016a, ACL 2016b, ACL 2017, NAACL 2018, EMNLP2018a, EMNLP2018b, CoNLL 2019 **Honorable mention**



Data collection

QA is an intuitive annotation format

Model design

Robust performance across domains

Can we integrate meaning into NLP?

ACL 2015, EACL 2017, SemEval 2017, NAACL 2017, SemEval 2019



Real-world application

Adverse drug reactions on social media

- Extracts **stand-alone propositions** from text
 - Barack Obama, a former U.S president, was born in Hawaii
 (Barack Obama, was born in, Hawaii)
 (a former U.S president, was born in, Hawaii)
 (Barack Obama, is, a former U.S. president)



- Extracts **stand-alone propositions** from text
 - Barack Obama, a former U.S president, was born in Hawaii
 (Barack Obama, was born in, Hawaii)
 (a former U.S president, was born in, Hawaii)
 (Barack Obama, is, a former U.S. president)
 - Obama and Bush were born in America
 (Obama, born in, America)
 (Bush, born in, America)





Mr. Pratt, head of marketing, thinks that lower wine prices have come about because producers don't like it when hit wines dramatically increase in price.

Mr. Pratt, head of marketing, thinks that lower wine prices have come about because producers don't like it when hit wines dramatically increase in price.



1. Mr Pratt **is** the head of marketing


- .. Mr Pratt **is** the head of marketing
- 2. lower wine prices have come about





- 1. Mr Pratt is the head of marketing
- 2. lower wine prices have come about
- 3. hit wines dramatically **increase** in price





- 1. Mr Pratt is the head of marketing
- 2. lower wine prices have come about
- 3. hit wines dramatically **increase** in price
- 4. producers don't like (3)





- 1. Mr Pratt is the head of marketing
- 2. lower wine prices have come about
- 3. hit wines dramatically **increase** in price
- 4. producers don't like (3)
- 5. (2) **happens** because of (4)





- 1. Mr Pratt is the head of marketing
- 2. lower wine prices have come about
- 3. hit wines dramatically **increase** in price
- 4. producers don't like (3)
- 5. (2) happens because of (4)
- 6. Mr Pratt **thinks** that (5)



Parsers for Meaning Representation

- **Goal** Build Open Information Extraction parsers from raw text
- Challenges
 - Obtaining data for the task

Expensive and non-trivial manual annotation

• **Designing a parser**

Which works well for real-world texts

Parsers for Meaning Representation

- **Goal** Build Open Information Extraction parsers from raw text
- Challenges
 - Obtaining data for the task
 Expensive and non-trivial manual annotation
 - Designing a parser

Which works well for real-world texts

Data Collection: Challenges

- Direct annotation requires linguistic expertise
 - Formal definitions for predicates and arguments

Data Collection: Challenges

- Direct annotation requires linguistic expertise
 - Formal definitions for predicates and arguments
- Existing datasets annotated only hundreds of sentences
 - Conflicting guidelines between different works
 - Do not support training

QA is an intuitive interface for data collection

EMNLP 2016

• QA pairs can be **deterministically converted to Open IE propositions**



QA is an intuitive interface for data collection

EMNLP 2016

• QA pairs can be **deterministically converted to Open IE propositions**



Question-Answer Meaning Representation NAACL 2018a

"Mr. Pratt, head of marketing, thinks that lower wine prices have come about because producers don't like it when hit wines dramatically increase in price."

- Who is the **head of marketing**?
- What have **come about**?
- What increased in price?
- 0

. . . .

Mr. Pratt lower wine prices hit wines



Question-Answer Meaning Representation NAACL 2018a

"Pierre Vinken, 61 years old, will join the board as a nonexecutive director Nov. 29."

Who will join the board? Pierre Vinken
 What will he jo
 When will Vinke
 When will Vinke



QA as an interface for data collection

• Yields the largest supervised dataset for the Open Information Extraction





Open IE: Challenges

- Obtaining data for the task
 - Expensive and non-trivial for manual annotation
- Building an Open IE parser
 - Which works well for real-world texts

Approach: word-level tagging task (Beginning, Inside, Outside)



NAACL 2018b

John jumped and Mary ran







NAACL 2018b



(John; **jumped**)

NAACL 2018b



(John; **jumped**)











Supervised Parser - Adaptation

- Integrated into the popular AllenNLP framework
 - Online demo receives thousands of requests per month

Albert Einstein published the theory of relativity in 1915



• Used by researchers in academia and tech (e.g., plasticity.ai, Diffbot)

Research Questions

Weaknesses in state of the art ACL 2019 Nominated for Best Paper MRQA 2019 Best Paper award EMNLP 2018

Building meaning representations EMNLP 2016a, EMNLP 2016b, ACL 2016a, ACL 2016b, ACL 2017, NAACL 2018, EMNLP2018a,

CoNLL 2019 **K** Honorable mention

Can we integrate meaning into NLP?

ACL 2015, EACL 2017, SemEval 2017, NAACL 2017, SemEval 2019



Real-world application

Adverse drug reactions on social media

Adverse Drug Reaction on Social Media



EACL 2017

Adverse Drug Reaction (ADR)

Unwanted reaction clearly associated with the intake of a drug

Adverse Drug Reaction on Social Media



EACL 2017

Adverse Drug Reaction (ADR)

Unwanted reaction clearly associated with the intake of a drug



I stopped taking Ambien after a week, it gave me a terrible headache!

Adverse Drug Reaction on Social Media



EACL 2017

Adverse Drug Reaction (ADR)

Unwanted reaction clearly associated with the intake of a drug



I stopped taking Ambien after a week, it gave me a terrible headache!

- Discover unknown side-effects
- Monitor drug reaction over time
- Respond to patient complaints

Challenges

- Context dependent
 - Ambien **gave me** terrible headaches
 - Ambien made my terrible headaches **go away**
- Colloquial
 - been having a hard time getting some Z's

Approach



- Recurrent neural network over **propositions** extracted from text
- Beneficial for the small amounts of data
 - Train: 5723 instances
 - Test: 1874 instances

Model



I recently switched to Advil, Ambien made me so dizzy!

Model


Model

Open IE:



Results and Analysis



- Mention Oracle marks all gold mentions, regardless of context
 - Errs on 45% of instances \rightarrow Context matters!



- Oracle marks all gold mentions, regardless of context
 - Errs on 45% of instances \rightarrow Context matters!
- Recurrent neural networks achieve ~80% F1



- Oracle marks all gold mentions, regardless of context
 - Errs on 45% of instances \rightarrow Context matters!
- Recurrent neural networks achieve ~80% F1
- Meaning representation provides 8% absolute improvement

Conclusions

• Implicit representations lead to biased performance



Conclusions

• Implicit representations lead to biased performance



• **Middle ground**: *Implicit* models with *explicit* meaning representation



Conclusions

• Implicit representations lead to biased performance



• **Middle ground**: *Implicit* models with *explicit* meaning representation



• Useful in real-world application



Conclusion: My contributions

Factuality detection

Reading comprehension

Do NLP models ACL 2019 Nominated f MRQA 2019 Best Paper EMNLP 2018	capture meaning? For Best Paper r award	Machine translation Word polysemy	QA evaluation QA Active learning
Open IE model QA reasoning First German Open IE	How can we build pa EMNLP 2016a, EMNLP 2016b, ACL 2016a, ACL 2016b, ACL 2017, NAACL 2018, EMNLP2018a, EMNLP2018b, CoNLL 2019 Honorable mentio	arsers for meaning?	Open IE dataset Paraphrase datasets Document representation
Adverse drug reactions Math QA Ca		an we integrate meaning into NLP?	

ACL 2015, EACL 2017, SemEval 2017, NAACL 2017, SemEval 2019



Future Work



Future Work: Interactive Semantics

• Current NLP setting assume single-input single-output



Future Work: Interactive Semantics

• Current NLP setting assume single-input single-output



• Human interaction is often iterative



Future Work: Interactive Semantics

• Current NLP setting assume single-input single-output



• Human interaction is often iterative



- Interactivity allows models and humans iterate to reach a solution
 - Will benefit from an explicit meaning representation

Future Work: Multilingual Meaning Bank

- Meaning representations are constructed almost exclusively in English
 - Linguistic theory needs to be adapted
 - Expert annotation is expensive



Future Work: Multilingual Meaning Bank

- Meaning representations are constructed almost exclusively in English
 - Linguistic theory needs to be adapted
 - Expert annotation is expensive
- A multilingual representation will facilitate:
 - Semantically coherent machine translation
 - NLP applications in **low-resource languages**



Я К Я Ä ጽ

Future Work: Multilingual Meaning Bank

- Meaning representations are constructed almost exclusively in English
 - Linguistic theory needs to be adapted
 - Expert annotation is expensive
- A multilingual representation will facilitate:
 - Semantically coherent machine translation
 - NLP applications in **low-resource languages**
- QA is appealing for multilingual representation
 - Intuitive for non-expert annotation
 - Hebrew as an intuitive first language



кя а ጽ

Future Work: NLP to inform decision making

In submission, 2019

• NLP technology is ripe to extract large-scale aggregates



Future Work: NLP to inform decision making

In submission, 2019

• NLP technology is ripe to extract large-scale aggregates



- Can aid in debates on other issues such as immigration or gun-violence
 - Extract gun assault trends, how weapons were obtained from news articles





Thanks for listening!